

COOLIER'S DEVELOPMENT TRAPS AND BARZELAY'S DESIGNING PROCESSES. ANALYSIS ON THE DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMS WITH A TERRITORIAL APPROACH FOR ANTIOQUIA*

ANÁLISIS DE LAS TRAMPAS DEL DESARROLLO DE COLLIER Y DEL DESIGNING PROCESS DE BARZELAY EN LOS PROGRAMAS DE DESARROLLO CON ENFOQUE TERRITORIAL EN ANTIOQUIA

.....
<https://doi.org/10.22431/25005227.vol50n2.1>

Gleidy Alexandra Urrego Estrada**
Jahir A. Gutiérrez-Ossa***

* This is a reflective paper and is the result from the research team of Laboratorio en Administración Pública (Public Administration Laboratory) – LABGMAP from the Escuela Superior de Administración Pública, ESAP, territorial Antioquia-Chocó, as a contribution to the Observatorio Público (Public Observatory) for supporting the creation of the Observatorio Público en Administración Pública y Políticas Públicas de la ESAP (ESAP Public Observatory in Public Administration and Public Policies) territorial Antioquia-Chocó which is coordinated by Ramiro Vélez.

** Public Administrator from the Escuela Superior de Administración Pública, ESAP, Magister on Habitat and PhD Candidate on Human and Social Sciences from the Universidad Nacional de Colombia. Lecturer at, ESAP, Territorial Antioquia-Chocó. gleidy.urrego@esap.edu.co. ORCID: 0000-0002-7040-0048 https://scholar.google.com/citations?user=nj3p_aUAAAAJ&hl=es

*** Industrial Economist, Universidad de Medellín, Colombia. Magister on Local and Regional Development, Universidad Pontificia Bolivariana, Medellín, Colombia, PhD on Public Administration, Honolulu, United States of America. Special Lecturer, ESAP, Territorial Antioquia-Chocó. Jahir.gutierrez@esap.edu.co. ORCID:0000-0001-8564-0397.https://scholar.google.es/citations?user=IW_BEkAAAAJ&hl=es

Abstract

This article raises the reflection on the traps of development on the perspective of conflict, politics, resources and the neighborhood and the designing process for the department of Antioquia. The methodological approach is qualitative with an exploratory approach to the theoretical approaches of Paul Collier and Michael Barzelay on development traps and the designing process, respectively. In this way, the analysis proposed by Collier and Barzelay, respectively, assesses the capacity that territories have, at first at the national level, to contribute to resolving differences in conflict, politics, natural resources, and the neighborhood. The way in which these elements are contemplated results in the improvement of the development conditions among the countries or leads

them to some development traps, considered in these matters. Following this, Barzelay raises the need to analyze problems from a holistic perspective from which difficulties provide the solution.

Key words: conflict; politics; natural resources; neighborhood; designing process.

Resumen

El artículo plantea la reflexión acerca de las trampas del desarrollo sobre la perspectiva del conflicto, la política, los recursos y la vecindad y el designing process para el departamento de Antioquia. El abordaje metodológico es cualitativo con enfoque exploratorio de los planteamientos teóricos de Paul Collier y Michael Barzelay sobre las trampas del desarrollo y el designing process, respectivamente. De esta manera, el análisis planteado por Collier y Barzelay, de manera respectiva, evalúa la capacidad que tienen los territorios en principio a escala nacional para contribuir a resolver las diferencias en materia de conflicto, la política, los recursos naturales y la vecindad, prueba para ello, que la manera en que estos elementos son contemplados redundará en el mejoramiento de las condiciones de desarrollo entre los países o los conduce a unas trampas del desarrollo, consideradas en dichas materias. Seguido de ello, Barzelay plantea la necesidad de analizar los problemas desde una óptica holística, desde la que las dificultades surten la solución.

Palabras clave: Conflicto; política; recursos naturales; vecindad; designing process.

Introduction

The issue that has motivated the discussion on this paper lies in determining the abilities that the Department of Antioquia has to face the demands that in terms of development with a territorial approach have been addressed in accordance with the post-conflict prioritization from Paul Collier and Michael Barzelay perspective, commended with associativity or entrenchment of the peace culture in the post-conflict criteria, to resolve the problematics that regarding conflict, politics, natural resources and neighbors the department has, and by the way, revive the institutions in charge of pulling off such topics.

It is still difficult for the department of Antioquia to conceive itself as a territorial unit, regarding its regional composition, this is because other geographic configuration forms, and political-administrative and geopolitical divisions are spread inside of it, placing each sub-region as a geography and territory corporeal element, in which the municipality seems to be outside. This is, that even in Antioquia's municipalities, as in the rest of the country, these are administrated from the condition of entity outside its territorial composition, and this has an impact over the territorial municipal endogenous planning.

Therefore, it has been complicated for the municipalities to conceive themselves in the matter of the conflicts they have to attend or face, thus, regarding the political orientation that should lead each region in accordance with joint interests from the municipality front itself and that, eventually, as attributes, they end up affecting the

neighbor conditions. Therefore, any hint of territorial reconfiguration necessarily goes through the revision of the conflicts, politics, resources, and the neighbors itself.

This document is focused in making evident the way how the department of Antioquia assumes its conflict, politics, resources, and neighbor problems with the neighbor departments and before the conception of subregion derived from the territorial associativity forms. Regarding that, this paper uses the qualitative method with an exploratory approach of the theoretical statements of Paul Collier and Michael Barzelay about development traps and the designing process respectively. So that this paper goes around the following components: territorial problems from the perspective of Collier's sub development traps and Michael Barzelay's regional associativity starting from the designing process premises, to overcome the municipal planning endogamy.

In this sense, the designing process for the department of Antioquia considers the following criteria: 1. The revision over the conflict, politic, natural resources and the neighbor managed in the department of Antioquia; 2. The characterization over the border disputes, the *Plan del Darién* Contract, and the development programs with territorial focus in the department of Antioquia; and 3. Expose to what extent the department of Antioquia can take hold through the designing process. Because this is an application work, we make use of the methodologies stated by Paul Collier and Michael Barzelay.

In the first place, Paul Collier analyzes countries and regions that have faced or fought against issues, politics, natural resources management and neighboring, starting from the idea that by using these same sources it can be possible to address options for the problems settled in such combination of elements, towards an institutional perspective. Then, Michael Barzelay points that the interaction between economic, legal, political and social explanations is the base for arguing alternatives, options or proposals to real issues, scenario in which the author calls this interaction (designing process), in which the problematic situation itself creates the attributes for diminishing the situation.

Contents

Perspective of Paul Collier and Michael Barzelay sub development traps on the regional associativity.

The theoretical approach including the analysis considered on Collier's sub development traps¹ and the Barzelay's public policies or issues consideration, represent the bastion that from such scale serve as a guide to the department of Antioquia case, which implies to consider the elements approaching or distancing them, such the ones stated under conflict, politics, natural resources and neighbor issues, so it will be possible to talk about convergence or for this case of interest, for the sponsorship of ways of associativity from the economic, legal, political and social order, so the issues could be overcome.

Collier argues the plight of the “bottom billion” is that they are caught in one (or often several) of four traps: (i) conflict; (ii) mismanaged dependency on natural resources; (iii) weak governance in a small country; and (iv) economic isolation among other very poor economies, with access to big markets available only at high cost. Or as he puts it in the African context, “landlocked with bad neighbors. O’Brien (2007, p. 95) In himself, the assumption here, as with Barzelay, is that the nature of the problem in concentrated enough on agenda-entrance that it no longer has a life of its own but is blended into a new policy process stream within assumptions about the nature of the problem to be dealt with remain relatively static. So once the agenda-setting has passed there would remain three stream come kingdom would have it, but these three would shift from “politics”, “policy” and “problem” to become (Howlett, 2013, p. 12).

Such work, despite of been very didactic and enlightening because – it facilitates a deeper knowledge of the continent, it is not more than a first step in the analysis that should continue with a deeper study taking into consideration each country particularity and each society (López & Machín, 2013, p. 7).

On the other hand, Collier, stresses four analysis spheres when assessing ex-ante, the possibilities that territories have when it comes to making a way to territorial convergence. Above any internal perspective or lineal or legal directive, this author considers the interaction the territories must assess starting from the role of the conflicts, politics, resources, and neighboring. For each case it is considered that territories should

firstly contemplate these fronts before embracing into matters of territorial evocations. In the words of Collier, “to my mind, the real challenge of development is not poverty reduction but international convergence. In a socially integrating world in which aspirations inevitably converge, massive income differences between countries will become increasingly problematic” (Collier, 2007, p. 188).

As for the conflicts exposed in Collier’s postulate, this contains the whole vision of the war from the wide and broad concept. In this sense, the various conflicts that the territories that are supposed to converge have had are analyzed, the state they are in, or the degree of advance or improvement. Under such scenario, the context of the conflicts that each one of the territories or municipality entities are facing, is considered, as well as the way they collectively or individually focus on them, regarding the situation of a municipality or territorial entity, hampering their interaction, driving them to the traps and to the non-associativity:

The conflict trap is evidently an impediment to economic diversification: the only investments that are warranted in such a high-risk context are for natural resource extraction. In turn, large rents from natural resources feed back onto the political process. A useful and widely used quantitative measure of political rights is the policy IV index (Collier, 2007, p. 195).

The revision of the conflicts does not imply the appetizer for the solution of such, but it does for their respective assessment and evaluation, elements that at the end of all end up orienting the interests that make more the convergence than the divergence possible. In this case, it is about putting on

territorial entities' table the various conflicts or differences over they have been discussing, under the basis of a diagnostic, strategic and proactive revision, to starting from such spaces, confront their differences in a joint manner. However, it is about such conflict does not leads to Collier has called sub development traps.

Empirically, the behavior of neighbours is important. To reduce the econometric problem of interdependence, we introduce neighbours military spending with a lag. When both the threat and emulation variables are entered into the regression, the former is completely insignificant whereas the latter is eliminated (Collier & Hoeffler, 2007, p. 8).

On each scenario it is reflected that the territories pretend to resolve the conflict via arguments, lawsuit, or administrative politic division, without yet understanding the significance of what preserve conflicts has. By avoiding or evading the conflict, at least one of the territories is leading to a sub development trap, because it is not about toning down conflicts, but about how despite them being present, we work together so the convergence surpasses the conflict coldness. "Although Collier and Gunning recognize the importance of policies, they do not go very far in identifying what makes a policy a bad one. What is largely missing is an analysis of the institutional conditions –the laws, traditions, customs, and habit- of countries and their populations" (Shaw, 2004, p. 4).

From the achievements emerged from conflicts or differences, the possibilities for the territories in conflict to create joint policies for their populations, territories, natural resources or neighbor interactions can be considered, committed to shared institutio-

nal decisions. In this sense, the formulation of joint policies is the first step to demonstrate that, despite the circumstances, is the ability to create agreements, pacts, and requirements as a single institutional body. It is not about creating new agencies or sectors but strengthening joint policies.

The results of our retesting are in part subject to the same methodological shortcoming we have identified in the Collier and Hoeffler paper, and as such, must be treated with caution. Nevertheless, we were able to demonstrate that there can be quite large variation in the possible extra effect of aid on growth during the post – conflict period depending upon the identification of the sample and slight changes in the specification of the variables (Shurke et al., 2005, p. 18).

The revision of the political issues implies giving a space to the interaction in topics related to administration and management, results and impacts, planning and projects, and of course, programs and strategic abilities the territories have to identify themselves on them, and by the way, contribute to the overcoming the politic trap of not agreeing, projecting or locating common interests required from this management path to be carried out. In this regard, it is worth to notice the question about the ability the territorial entities have to work on projection material with various entities in hand with the issues they share or divide them.

This "evidence deficit" is compounded by a tendency to look for conclusions based on the policy instruments one already has. Thus, analysts and practitioners tend to neglect the regional level of analysis because international actors have few policy tools to engage regionally (Call & Cousens, 2008, p. 19).

The advance regarding politics might make possible that each subregion be permeable not only to condition the public management among their municipal peers, but to be understood as a single unit or entity that public, private or international interests can see as one when approaching to it. It is aimed that the sub-regions can be evidenced in a structural and institutional order, that in addition to impregnate the geographic and territorial reality, the proposals or projects required by the subregions and each one of their municipalities in diverse fields can be aligned:

On the other hand, other mere political interests tend to be added to the economic ones and, in fact, in deterrent terms it is more effective to transform economic costs into political costs to achieve a higher reaction from the administrative. This nuance, that could be well considered as a grave objection to the economic maximization analysis, should not "paralyze" such observation. Instead, should serve to analyze the administrative conduct as an activity that collects parallel optimizations. On one hand, economic, on the other hand political (Letelier, 2013, p.318).

Natural resources management as a part of the series of topics to be considered by the institutions, states or municipal entities, equally must be considered from the perspective of subregion. It is not about generating access, charges, or impact conditions in an individual way or without consensus, but about see the territorial reality to the extent that the scenario perceives different mobilities triggered by several actors. It is evident that if the natural resources are not

considered from a multi-territorial perspective, any intermunicipal, sub-regional or departmental glimpse can be considered as an intromission.

Regarding the management of natural resources, each one of the Antioqueñan sub-regions are submitted to an exacerbated expansion of the metropolitan concept or urban-city or conurbation scenarios. However, most of the municipalities of the department are very apart from the metropolitan or urban-centered area reality, in addition to departmental neighbor issues: "The international trade in natural resources, and its associated international transactions of prospecting and investment in exploitation, are a major component of international economic activity" (Collier & Venables, 2010, p. 19). Neighbor concept corresponds to the measurement unit in which the interaction among the various municipal units complements the territoriality of their peers in the sub-region and delimitate the departmental ones, as stated by Barzelay²:

More specifically, Barzelay considers how to translate widely disseminated ideas about the design instrumental case studies into specific guidance for this research program. It seems fitting to summarize the main points briefly here. The Barzelay article provides a narrative history of an episode where the "management system" for a government-wide program of presidential priority project (Barzelay & Thompson, 2008, p. 11).

Barzelay collects the empiric evidence placed on the diagnostics, experiences, strategies, or programs and exalt them inasmuch as from those ones can be computerized to answer for economic, legal, political and social criteria on which weight the problematic or difficulty to be addressed in a

way it is being instrumental may contribute to the revision of the problem, and not that the last be the one guiding the components to be considered. Therefore, Barzelay attends the circumstances as these can be materialized and explained from several fronts. "To take part in a productive way in a cosmopolitan discussion about public administration, a reader would need a terrain map" (Barzelay, 2003, p. 242). The designing process contemplates the possibility that the actors be the ones who construct the design, project or program surrounding the reality to dealt with. It is precisely about adding knowledge, but also ways out from the issues in question. Under this scenario, a wide creative action is required on the base of understanding itself as apart from a scenery, and that this one recreates the same possibilities of action. It is about mediate, schematize or formulate the paths or road maps the problem must take in a positively manner, to the extent the can be processed or materialized:

A grounded rule employs mechanism-bases causal analysis to conceptualize how a stylized response to a challenge, such as planned line of managerial action, would potentially change given conditions into preferred ones. As bundles of formal expert knowledge, grounded rules are essential but not fully satisfactory because outcomes necessarily result from the interplay of mechanism and context (Barzelay, 2012, p. 6).

Barzelay states a road map on which is possible that the topic comes to be considered under a frame of a balance between the empiric evidence, the study case or field work, as far as this one could be analytically materialized. In such case, for what is intended with the foundation of the territorial development projects in regard to the post-conflict, it is necessary to precisely identify how from the empiric evidence highlighted by each municipal entity or each sub-region as a whole it would be possible to take shape under the road map stated by Barzelay or boasted by the designing process, *raison d'être* in intervention cases.

Chart 1: Functions of an instrumental case.

FUNCTION	DEFINITION OF QUALITY	HOW TO EXECUTE THE FUNCTION WITH HIGH QUALITY
Present the topic	Reader easily understands the topic.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Locate the topic 2. Locate the topic in a relation with an academic debate about politics or a professional one.
Justify the topic	Reader accepts that the topic is important, legitimate and demands an additional research effort.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Show that the topic has reached a provided position in the scientific archive. 2. Show interest on the scientific archive. 3. Show interest on the topic. 4. maintain that more research of the type within the paper will satisfy that need.

FUNCTION	DEFINITION OF QUALITY	HOW TO EXECUTE THE FUNCTION WITH HIGH QUALITY
Present the case	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Studied experience is viewed as intrinsically interesting (easy to reach) by reader who are not very much interested in the topic. 2. Studied experience is intuitively perceived as an instrumental study case, especially on the part of the ones who feel very interested on the topic. 3. The reader trusts the author is a skilled narrator. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Present a global vision narrative of the experience which shows the event structure through the analysis of the episodes. 2. Evoke a comprehension of the story plot. 3. Make sure the global narrative vision has a similar structure and event and is perceived as existent study cases on similar topics. With distinctive "twists" of the evidence standard story.
Justify the case	The reader accepts the argument that the studied experience is historical and/or analytically significative.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Present a clear argument about the historic signification of the studied experience and/or. 2. Present clear argument regarding the analytic significance of the experience related with the topic.
Head to a scientific approach	The reader perceives that the author has a scientific identity. The reader trusts the author will be able to extract the analytic significance of the studied experience based on the legitimate scientific approach.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. After presenting and justifying both, the topic and the experience, make a direct introduction to the chosen scientific approach. 2. Exemplify in what way will be used the scientific approach to order the evidence of the case (for example, analytically identifying results from significative events) 3. Exemplify how the scientific approach will be used to explain results of events (for example, identifying explicative factors and social processes/mechanisms that link processes/mechanisms to those factors with effects such as the results of the event).

Source: Barzelay & Thompson (2001, p. 505).

So that the analysis stated by Collier and Barzelay, respectively, assesses the ability that territories have on a national scale at first, to contribute to resolve the differences regarding conflict, politics, natural resources and neighbor, proof of that, the way these elements are contemplated results in the improvement of developing conditions between countries or leads them to some development traps, considered in such matters. After that, Barzelay states the need of analyzing problems from a holistic point of view from which difficulties spurt solutions.

Conclusions

It is important to characterize conflict, political, natural resources and neighbor patterns surrounding the department of Antioquia with its own regions, since the agglomeration of initiatives derived from the Peace Process and from the same action of the State purpose regarding planning, peace contracts, or territorial pacts, since they do not only trigger the interest for reinforce the state purposes, but also they over-

come difficulties in such patterns that had explained not only the tension between the State and the Territories starting with the departments, but also the tension between themselves, which has not been possible to overcome due to other agendas out of the territorial consolidation via processes.

In the same line of interest there is the purpose of taking advantage of stated patterns, as long as difficulties can be resolved with them, difficulties that precisely have not been possible to bring forward because few or nothing at all has been done for these topics be included in the territorial ordering, planning, or developing agenda, scenario that exposes to a great extent the interest of the State in not sponsoring its purposes, the difficulty in pushing them forward if no action is taken to resolve basic issues such as border disputes, poverty inside the zones, the excess of exploitation of natural resources and the nature of the conflict itself that makes impossible to order the territories.

Finally, it is intended to get more clarity about the interaction between the above-mentioned patterns regarding the rights, legal status along with populational and territorial ones, so that the studied territories effectively have a space or possibility to cope with such intra and inter territorial closing gaps. This is, that these bets should not only contain an initial purpose of recompose above mentioned patterns, but also is to be expected that such bets resolve basic issues regarding rights, legal, populational approaches, starting from the consummation of the initial process.

References

- Barzelay, M. (2012). Studying Public Management as a Design Science. *XVII Congreso Internacional del CLAD sobre la Reforma del Estado y de la administración Pública*. Cartagena, Colombia.
- Barzelay, M., & Thompson, F. (2009). All aboard? Evidence-based Management Scholarship. *International Public Management Journal*. 12 (3), pp. 289-309.
- Barzelay, M., & Thompson, F. (2008). *Making Public Management a Design-oriented Science*. London School of Economics and Political Science and Willamette University.
- Barzelay, M., & Cortázar V., J. C. (2004). Una guía práctica para la elaboración de estudios de caso sobre buenas prácticas en gerencia social. Estudio de caso 1. *Instituto interamericano para el desarrollo sostenible (INDES)*. Banco Interamericano de Desarrollo.
- Barzelay, M. (2003). La nueva gerencia pública: invitación a un diálogo cosmopolita. *Gestión y política pública*. 12 (2), pp. 241-251.
- (2001). La nueva gerencia pública. Un ensayo bibliográfico para estudiosos latinoamericanos (y otros). *Publicado en la Revista del CLAD Reforma y Democracia*. (19), pp. 1-35.

- Call, C. T., & Cousens, E.M. (2008). Ending Wars and Building Peace: International Responses to War-torn Societies. *International Studies Perspectives*, 9, pp. 1-21.
- Chauvet, L., & Collier, P. (2004). *Development Effectiveness in Fragile States: Spillovers and Turn a Rounds*. Centre for the Study African Economies, Department of Economics, Oxford University. pp. 1-28.
- Collier, P., & Venables, A. J. (2010). International Rules for Trade in Natural Resources. World Trade Organization. *Staff Working Paper ERSD-2010-06*.
- Collier, P., and Hoeffler, A. (2007). *Unintended Consequences: Does Aid Promote Arms Races?* Oxford Bulletin of Economics and Statistics. 69 (1), pp. 1-27.
- Howlett, M., Mc Connell, A., & Perl, A. (2013). Reconciling Streams and Stages: Avoiding Mixed Metaphors in the Characterization of Policy Processes. *1st International Conference on Public Policy*. Grenoble, France.
- Letelier W., R. (2013). Algunos aspectos económicos de la responsabilidad extracontractual del Estado. *Revista de Derecho*. 20 (1), pp. 309-321.
- Pujinda, P (2007). *The Competitiveness of Airport Regions in Southeast Asia: The Lesson from Two Arc Rivals in Europe*. Department of Urban and Regional Planning Faculty of Architecture. Chulalongkorn University. Thailand. pp. 69-80.
- Shaw, J. S. (2004). Overlooking the Obvious in Africa. A Comment on: Collier, Paul, and Jan Willem Gunning. 1999. Why Has Africa Grown Slowly? *Journal Of Economic Perspectives*. 12 (3), pp. 3-22.
- Shurke, A., Villanger, E., & Woodward L., S. (2005). *Economic Aid to Post-conflict Countries: A Methodological Critique of Collier and Hoeffler*. Michelsen Institute Development Studies and Human Rights. (4), pp. 1-29.